SPREADING BULGARIAN MEDIEVAL MANUSCRIPTS WITH NATURAL SCIENCE CONTENT IN WALLACHIA AND MOLDAVIA

Tsvetana Cholova
New Bulgarian University, Sofia
tcholova@abv.bg


Abstract: Bulgarian medieval Philosophy and Natural Sciences were of great significance for the development of the natural sciences of the Orthodox Slavs and in the Balkan countries: Serbia, Russia, Wallachia and Moldavia. After the Ottoman conquest of Bulgaria, many valuable Bulgarian manuscripts were taken out of the country and many Bulgarian scholars, grammarians and clergymen were sent into exile. This article presents the spread of the natural sciences in the Principalities of Wallachia and Moldavia by the preserved manuscripts and translations of Greek and Bulgarian works, such as “Physiologus”, “Hexaemeron” by Severianus of Cabala, Symeon’s “Miscellany”, (“Izbornik Svyatoslava” 1073), Erotapokriseis, etc.


Keywords: Slavonic manuscripts, miscellanies, Bulgarian culture.
At the end of the 14th century and the beginning of the 15th, the development of culture in the Wallachian and Moldavian principalities was strongly influenced by the Bulgarian medieval culture. The Slavonic and Proto-Bulgarian culture had prevailed in these territories long before the creation of the Bulgarian State. After the adoption of Christianity in Bulgaria, Old Bulgarian culture was established over the entire territory, including the so-called Transdanubian Lands.

Bulgarian medieval philosophy and natural sciences had a great significance for the Balkan countries such as Serbia, Wallachia and Moldavia, and for Russia as well. Depending on their specific features, these countries adopted and developed a typological cultural model created in Bulgaria on the basis of Byzantine culture and science. As the Byzantine culture and science was very rich, they differed in this respect from the typological model. A new cultural and historical trend was created in Bulgaria, and it became specific for Serbia, Russia, Wallachia and Moldavia from the Middle Ages up until the penetration of the Renaissance culture and science from West Europe, which laid the foundation of modern culture and science.¹

Thanks to the new researches in the last decades, we come to the conclusion that Moldavia has a leading role in spreading the Bulgarian culture, compared to Serbia and Russia.² The cultural development of Wallachian and Moldavian principalities was under the influence of Russian and Central Europe, but it was established by the type of culture developed in Bulgaria and Bulgarian lands.

The typological cultural model created in Bulgaria was also found in Serbia, Wallachia and Moldavia. During the Middle Ages, Serbian culture and natural sciences had been developed within the framework of that model, while later the direct contacts with Byzantine culture were increased and the influence of West European culture became stronger. The importance of Bulgarian culture and science for Serbians in the Middle Ages was determined by several factors: the existence of the literary centres in the monasteries of Mount Athos, where Bulgarian, Serbian Wallachian and Moldavian writers worked together; the seizure and inheritance of Bulgarian cultural centres and monasteries by the Wallachian and Moldavian State, the transfer (at the end of 14th - 15th centuries) of Bulgarian scholars (as Gregory Tsamblak) and their active participation in the cultural life there, etc.

After the Ottoman conquest of Bulgaria, many valuable Bulgarian books were taken out of the country and many Bulgarian scholars, grammarians and clerics were sent into exile. This created a precondition for the establishment of Bulgarian language and Bulgarian culture in these principalities. The works of such eminent Bul-

² П. Бойчева, Към въпроса за участиято на среднобългарската литература в църковно-политическия живот на Молдова през XV-XVI в [To the Issue of the Middle Ages Bulgarian Literature’s implication in Church and Political Life of Moldavia, 15th-16th Century], in Българите в северното причерноморие [Bulgarians in the Northern Coast of Black Sea], Т. I, Велико Търново, 1992, p. 82.
Spreading Bulgarian medieval manuscripts with Natural Science content in Wallachia and Moldavia

garian writers (as Gregory Tsamblak, etc. who loom refuge in the Wallachian and Moldavian monasteries and towns), contributed to the establishment of Bulgarian culture there. The spread of the natural sciences in the principalities of Wallachia and Moldavia was facilitated by the manuscripts and transcripts of some Greek and Bulgarian works, which included works or abstracts. These were mainly miscellanies brought out of the Bulgarian lands and used in the monasteries of Wallachia and Moldavia, though some of them were written in Bulgarian in these very monasteries. These miscellanies and some single works (e.g. Physiologus) were well received there and later contributed to the creation of stories and proverbs about animals in the Romanian literature (from 17th century onwards). Some works on natural sciences like Interpretative Palea, and certain miscellanies like the Lovech's Miscellany, written before 1331 and containing excerpts from the Hexaemeron of Severian of Cabala, etc., were taken initially to the monasteries of Wallachia and Moldavia and later were transferred to Mount Athos, Russia and West European countries.

Considering the fact that the Old Bulgarian language was an official language in these principalities (as the language of the church and literature until the 17th century), the Old Bulgarian letter numeration was used for practical calculations. The Bulgarian culture and technical knowledge also prevailed in the field of architecture, building, and military technology.

Before the establishment of the Hungarian political rule and Western Church influence in the majority of Transylvanian lands, the Bulgarian and Byzantine culture prevailed there also, in the different periods. After the Ottoman conquest, Bulgarian manuscripts containing information of natural sciences were housed in the Transylvanian monasteries too.

The tendencies in the cultural policy of tsar Symeon during the "Golden Age" proved vital throughout the middle Ages in Bulgaria, as well as in the other countries belonging to this cultural circle: Serbia, Russia, Wallachia, Moldavia. The works of the following centuries (13th - 15th centuries) were influenced by the Preslav literary centre. The Symeon’s Miscellany, the early Bulgarian compilation of 10-th century (preserved in its earliest Russian copy of the 12th century, known as Izbornik Svyatoslava) leaded the philosophic and natural scientific thought. It was the first work which gave, through the translation of Theodore of Rhaithu's Treatise into Old Bulgarian, some formulations, explanations and terms proper of certain abstract philosophic concept and categories (according to Aristotel's Organon, Metaphysic). This Treatise gave the Bulgarian reader access to introductory material on Aristotelian philosophy and necessitated the creation of philosophical terminology, parts of which have survived in several Slavonic languages to the present day.

---


4 J. Jufu, Manuscriscele slave din Transilvania [Slavonian Manuscripts from Transilvania], „Romanoslavica”, VIII, 1963, p. 48.
The articles on natural sciences subjects in the Miscellany rather comply with its generally theological character, referring to excerpts of the treatise On Human Nature by Nemesius of Emessa, the article on the name of the months, given by the different nations, ascribed to John of Damascus, etc.\(^5\)

Many of the works created in the Preslav’s literary school are seen primarily as a theological and literary, but none has studied yet their function as educational literature. Miscellany of Symeon (Svyatoslav of 1073) is one of the best examples of this type of educational literature, designed to form the higher clergy.\(^6\) The researchers have called it: “medieval encyclopaedia” because of its rich and multifaceted content, but few authors have paid attention to its obvious destination as a theological school anthology. Even the title leads us to this conclusion: “Sbora of mnoga otetsa, tolko-\(\)kovanie o nerazumniha slovesaha inih kniga gotova otvyata” (Explanation, collected from [works of] many church fathers, interpretation of the ambiguous areas of the Gospel and the Apostles, and other books. In brief, it means: in order to be learnt fast and to provide a quick answer.

The content of Miscellany is even more revealing as it comes to its use as a teaching tool. The works included in Miscellany have various contents, but their main feature as an introduction to a given scientific field is obvious. This applies not only for the most voluminous essay in the miscellany Questions and Answers of St. Athanasius of Alexandria, but also for the work of Saint Basil the Great, especially the work of George Choiroboskos Peri tropon, the essay of John of Damascus for the twelve months and the one of Nemesius of Emesa on anatomy and physiology of man, etc. It must be underlined that the content of the Miscellany does not reflect the state of the Byzantine literature in 9\(^{th}\) - 10\(^{th}\) centuries, but is more characteristic for the patristic period. There is still no detailed analysis of its articles in terms of their purpose, but they were not selected randomly. For example, one of the works included in the Miscellany – the comments of Theodore of Raithu on the Categories of Aristotle – is essential for the study of philosophy. The Aristotle’s Categories have been a necessary introduction to the study of philosophy throughout the middle ages. Even today, the main philosophical concepts are studied starting by this treatise. The fact that the newly created Bulgarian literary language was used to create such high philosophical concepts as “substance”, “contents”, “quantity”, “quality”, “time”, “action”, “space” etc., concepts that we still use today, is even more impressive. This is certain evidence that the Miscellany was translated as a textbook for higher education.

The other treatises included in the Miscellany can also be related to an introduction to the sciences of “quadrivium”. The treatise of George Choiroboskos Peri tropon was released as a textbook in Byzantine universities and was used in teaching

---


Spreading Bulgarian medieval manuscripts with Natural Science content in Wallachia and Moldavia

grammars, and especially rhetoric. The treatise contains a definition of 27 poetic tropes and figures, which are translated with Bulgarian counterparts, some of which we still use today.

One of the highly popular works in the middle ages in Bulgaria was the so-called Physiologus. Most of the researchers believe that Physiologus belongs to the Alexandrian literature written in the 2nd – 3rd century. In some individual articles it describes the lifestyle, the leadership, and the appearance of animals – some existing, some not, characteristics of minerals and plants; each of these descriptions is accompanied by symbolic religious interpretations. The diverse and approachable language can be one of the reasons for the popularization of the book in the Middle Ages in all European countries. The Greek manuscript of Physiologus is relatively well studied as well as the translations and adaptations in other languages. To a certain point this relates to its Slavonic version.

In fact, in the foundation of the Old Bulgarian language and Old Bulgarian translations there are various versions of the Greek Physiologus. For instance, the Russian version comes from the 15th century and according to the researches it had a Bulgarian prototype. This early Bulgarian translation was made by the first Greek version, which relate to other manuscripts. However, A. Karneev excludes of his research a big part of the South Slavonic manuscripts, belonging – according to him – to Bestiaries.

The South Slavonic manuscripts can be divided into two groups: 1. an old one, which includes three of the Russian versions but with a Bulgarian prototype, and 2. a derived group, to which the rest are related. The manuscripts from the first group were made by two separate Bulgarian translations from Greek, probably dated to about 10th - 11th century, while the manuscripts of the second group are later Bulgarian translations (14th – 15th century). The oldest preserved Slavonic manuscripts of Physiologus dates from the 15th century.

7 A. Карнеев, Материалы и заметки по литературной истории Физиолога [Materials and Notes on the Literary History of Physiologus], Санкт Петербург, 1890, p. 26-27; F. Sbordone, Physiologus, Mediæli-Napoli, 1936, p. XII.
11 A. Karneev, op. cit., p. 147 ; Troitsko-Sergievata lavra, No. 729, part of the Interpretation pallets (pp. 155-182); pp. 149, XXXIV-XXXV.
In this type of South Slavonic manuscripts the symbolic-religious parts are significantly shortened and give a way to more information about animals and their moral-allegorical interpretations. More popular version of this adaptation in Bulgaria, Serbia, Wallachia and Moldavia in the 15th – 17th centuries corresponded with the *zeitgeist* and showed an increasing interest of educated people toward a positive knowledge and fiction. Since the 15th century, *Physiologus* was a constant component of most of the so-called miscellanies with a mixed content, typical for the Bulgarian literature of this period.

The *Physiologus* contained interesting description of animals, their nature and behaviour. The first version of *Physiologus* that was spread in the Orthodox countries, originated from an earlier Old Bulgarian translation (probably from the 10th century). The second South Slavonic translation of this book (14th century) was well received in Bulgarian, Serbian, Wallachian and Moldavian territories and served for a long time as a manual. Most of the preserved manuscripts date back in the 15th – 16th century, but one of the earlier documents can be found in the Cluj Napoca Museum, dating from the 14th – 15th centuries.

A detailed research of the popular medieval version of *Physiologus* in Romania was implemented by P. Olteanu. He analysed the preserved copies by proving that the translations of the story are of Old Bulgarian version as they are included in miscellanies with mixed stories on astrological, zoological, parenthetic, etc. topic. He follows also the popularization of various stories of *Physiologus* in the Romanian literature and folklore.

The interest in the works on the natural sciences in the 12th - 14th centuries is manifested predominantly in the translations of Severian of Gabala’s *Hexaemeron* and George of Pisidia’s *Proskinitaria*. *Hexaemeron* take one of the main places among the stories with scientific contents in the medieval Bulgarian and other Slavic literatures. The most significant production of this type without any doubt is *Hexaemeron* of John Exarch, whose significance is evident of its popularity in the Slavic countries and its multiple copies until the 19th century. The medieval Bulgarian natural science went outside the traditional frames in the commentaries on the *Creation* and formed a real encyclopaedia of medieval knowledge. Almost all known *Hexaemeron* in Russia and Serbia were written or translated for the first time in Bulgaria, but the condition of the research still does not allow for some of them certain natural scientific conclusions to be made. In the medieval literature of Wallachia and Moldavia some excerpts of *Hexaemeron* of Severian of Gabala and liturgical *Hexa-

14 C. Giannelli, *Di alcune versioni e rielaborazioni Serbe delle "Solutiones breves quaestionum naturalium" attribuite a Michele Psello*, “Studi bizantini e neoellenici”, V, 1939, pp. 445-468;
16 Н. Радошевић, *Шестоднев Георгия Писиде и његов словенски перевод* [Hexaemer of George of Pisidia and its Slavonic translation], Београд, 1979, p 99.
Emerons were kept.\textsuperscript{17} Hexaemerons ("Six sermons for the Creation of the world ") of Severian of Emessa (Syria) became famous in Bulgaria as the work of John Exarch, and later was translated as an independent work of Gabala.\textsuperscript{18} The bishop of Gabala, Severian lived in Constantinople, in the 4\textsuperscript{th}-5\textsuperscript{th} century, when the conflict with the Patriarch of Constantinople, St. John Chrysostom,\textsuperscript{19} resulted in the removal of the Patriarch from his position. Until the 18\textsuperscript{th} – 19\textsuperscript{th} century the stories of Severian of Gabala and especially his Hexaemerons were often believed to be written by St. John Chrysostom, more popular in the Middle Ages. Severian was a follower of the Antiochian Orthodox School and in some of his views the suited a lot of the later Nizibian fathers and apologists such as Teodor Mopsuetski and Kozma Indikoplevst.\textsuperscript{20} The beliefs of Severian for a number of natural scientific issues especially the cosmographic were actually much more primitive than those of St. Basil the Great. Hexaemerons of the bishop of Gabala is devoted to theological questions, but some natural scientific knowledge is also included. It was translated into Bulgarian probably in the 14\textsuperscript{th} century but only fragments are preserved.\textsuperscript{21} A full copy is kept dating back in the 15\textsuperscript{th} century, made by a Bulgarian manuscript which had not reached to us. In a Serbian and a Russian version, many other copies of the Severian’s Hexaemerons are kept until the 18\textsuperscript{th} century.\textsuperscript{22} Fragments of Hexaemerons can also be seen in the Lovech’s Miscellany – written before 1331, and in the Miscellany of priest Fillip, dated 1345.\textsuperscript{23} Probably between the 10\textsuperscript{th} and the 13\textsuperscript{th} century, in Bulgaria these documents were translated from Greek or composed on the basis of Greek principals didactic miscellanies with sentences (sententiae) of ancient scholars and philosophers and of Christian writers who were used in education. These miscellanies are familiar by the multiple manuscripts and different editions of later periods under the name “Bee”. The earliest preserved is the Slavonic manuscript of the 14\textsuperscript{th} century.\textsuperscript{24}

\begin{footnotes}
\item[17] Ц. Чолова, Естественонаучните знания в средновековна България [Natural Scientific Knowledge in Medieval Bulgaria], София, 1988, p. 22.
\item[18] Severiani, Hexaemerons, Patrologia Graeca, coll. 429—516.
\item[21] А. Горский, К. Невоструев, Описание славянских рукописей Московской Синодальной библиотеки [Description of Slavic Manuscripts from the Moscow Synodal Library], Москва, 1855 – 1917, Т. II, 1, 1345, 38, p. 21.
\item[22] Ibid., p. 631.
\item[23] К. Куев, op. cit., p. 37.
\item[24] I. Martinov, Les manuscrits slaves de la bibiothèque impériale de Paris, Paris, 1858; B. M. Семенов, Древне-русская Пчела по пергаменному списку XIV в. [Old Russian Bee on a Parchment Copy from 14\textsuperscript{th} century], Санкт Петербург, 1893; М. Н. Сперанский, Переводные сборники изречений в славно-русской письменности. Исследование и тексты [Translated Miscellanies in the Slavic-Russian Literature. Research and texts],
\end{footnotes}
The Slavonic versions of the very popular manuscript in Byzantium Florilegium are believed to be written by Maximus the Confessor, and St. Johannes Damascus. Since the 11th century it was spread in the monk Antonius compilation, under the name MeAshoa ("Bee"). The main Slavonic manuscripts and editions are researched as early as in the beginning of the last century, as the most detailed research is by the Russian scholar M. N. Speranski. The most recent research is of A. Miltenova. I mention these miscellanies even though their contents are dedicated to theological and social-ethical issues because some of them are in separate sayings related to the knowledge of nature. In various miscellanies with mixed contents versions of the stories with short questions and answers can be seen – the translation of "Bee", questions and answers on different topics – theological, natural scientific, etc. A miscellany with such content is kept in the library of the Romanian Academy of Science, the Museum of Brasov and Cluj Napoca.

The traditions of the Turnovo literary school were still maintained in the 15th - 16th centuries outside the conquered Bulgarian lands by the efforts of some eminent Bulgarian scholars. Constantine Costenetchki had greatly contributed to the diffusion of geographical and cosmographical knowledge during that period. The researchers produced evidence to the effect that one of the major works considered as a source of knowledge in cosmology in medieval Serbia, Fragments of Medieval Cosmography and Geography was composed by Constantine Costenechki, while the so-called Bogishich's Miscellany of the 16th century – containing one of the fullest transcripts of the work – was compiled or transcribed by the Bulgarian scholar Visarion of Debar.

The work of Constantine Costenetchki Fragments of Medieval Cosmography and Geography was based on Michael Psell's writings De omnifaria doctrina and Solutiones breves quaestionum naturalium (the latter has reached us under the name of Symeon Seth). The Bulgarian scholar had also added some abstracts about Cosmography and Geography. The work was spread in the Balkan countries and it could be assumed as one of the most significant works in this field until the literature of the Modern Age emerged. The Wallachian and Moldavian princes maintained direct contacts with the monasteries on Mount Athos and supported them with donations. Some Greek manuscripts about the natural sciences (like the work ascribed to Michael Psellos, under the name Symeon Seth, Brief Summary on the Problems of Nature), are encountered in many transcripts in the Wallachian and Moldovan monas-


24 М. Н. Сперанский, op. cit., p. 158.


27 Ibid., p. 565.

28 C. Giannelli, op.cit., p. 463.
Spreading Bulgarian medieval manuscripts with Natural Science content
in Wallachia and Moldavia

teries. Many parallels of *Fragments of Cosmography and Geography* of Constantine Costenetitchki can be found in the Greek manuscripts, kept in the library of the Romanian Academy of Sciences in Bucharest. C. Giannelli informs us about them who found, besides the known three, one more manuscript with similar fragment. It is believed to be the story of Michael Psellos (everywhere in the Greek manuscripts in Bucharest, as well as in the Bulgarian ones this story is under the name of Symeon Seth) which was very popular as an educational book until the 19th century.

The development of culture, natural sciences and technical skills in Wallachia and Moldavia, as well as in the Transylvania was influenced directly by the culture of Byzantium. The popularization of the Bulgarian medieval manuscripts about the natural science in the Wallachia-Moldavian principalities lands after the 15th century is evident mainly by the kept copies of Bulgarian stories with natural science. The miscellanies with mixed contents containing apocrypha and stories of the “denied” literature in medieval Bulgaria were noted too soon. These miscellanies and some individual stories such as *Physiologus*, *Miscellany of Tsar Simeon*, stories and speeches of the Bulgarian scholar John Exarch were well accepted in the culture of Wallachia, Moldavia, and Transylvania until the 19th century. They have had significant impact on the creation of the stories and proverbs about animals in Romanian literature since the 17th century. Some works with natural science contents transferred from Bulgaria initially were brought to the Monasteries of Wallachia and Moldavia and later were transported to Russia.

The relations between Bulgaria, Wallachia, and Moldavia in the 14th century were intense, and the dynastic marriages between Bulgarian rulers and the rulers of Wallachia and Moldavia contribute to the commercial and cultural exchange. The Bulgarian tsar Ivan Alexander (1331-1337) was the son-in-law of Ioan Basarab (1325-1340), the Wallachian warlord. Ana, the wife of Ivan Stratsimir, was the daughter of the Wallachian warlord Alexander Basarab (1330-1365). The commercial connections were revived, when Ivan Stratsimir allowed the Brasov traders free commerce in the Vidin Kingdom. The contacts in the area of culture became also very tight. In the biography of Theodosius of Tarnovo on Patriarch Kalist, it is written that the fame of the Literary School in the Kilifarevo Monastery spread to the North of the Danube River and the students from Wallachia came to Theodosius of Tarno-

---

32 A. Яцимирский, *Славянские и русские рукописи румынских библиотек* [Slavic and Russian manuscripts in Romanian libraries], Санкт Петербург, 1905, Т. LXIX, p. 79.
34 К. Куев, *op. cit.*, pp. 29, 36.
vo. Gregory Tsamblak wrote that students from the North and the South came to the School of Evtimiy, at the Patriarchal Monastery “Holy Trinity” in Tarnovo. Konstantin Kostneckhi mentioned that Evtimiy had students of the Scythian areas, from the North of the Danube River. Patriarch Evtimiy of Tarnovo kept correspondence with the famous Modavian Scholar of Bulgarian origin – Nicodim of Tismana. Along with his students, he founded the Neamt Monastery – one of the most popular monasteries in Moldavia – and later, he was sanctified.

Significant for popularizing culture and building monasteries in Moldavia is the policy of the Moldavian prince Alexander the Kind (1402-1431). He hosted many of the scholars who ran from the enslaved Bulgarian lands and gave them a chance to settle and develop their literature and church activity. The Monasteries Bistritsa and Biserici were founded by monks who came from the South of the Danube. Probably, at the same time, in Moldavia, Wallachia and Transylvania many valuable Bulgarian manuscripts were transferred. Some of them still wander and settle in Mount Athos or in different countries and cities in Europe. Such are the Tetraevangelia of Ivan Alexander of 1356, and the Tomić Psalter – both with numerous illustrations – as well as the Lovech’s Miscellany written before 1331, the Miscellany of Priest Fillip, dating 1345, the Miscellany of Ivan Alexander (Lavrentiev) of 1348, etc.

The Lovech’s Miscellany, written before 1331, is a medieval Bulgarian manuscript with a mixed content. It was written by the monk Pahomiy, during the period in which Ivan Alexander was despot in Lovech. The Miscellany contains works with theological and religious character, natural science stories – containing excerpts from the Severian’s Hexaemeron and fortune-teller books. Currently it is kept in the Library of the Academy of Science in Sankt Petersburg. Similar is the contents of the Miscellany of Priest Fillip, dating 1345. After Bulgaria fell under Ottoman rule, Gregory Tsamblak spent some time in the Lower-Danubian principality. Between 1401 and 1406 he was a presbyter of the Great church of Moldavia with capital Suceava, in the “Pantokratoros” monastery (Neamt). There he wrote the biography if Ioan Novi of Suceava. Nowadays, 294 manuscripts can be found in this monastery.

36 В. Киселков, Житието на Теодосий Търновски като исторически паметник [The Life of Theodosius of Tarnovo as a Historic Monument], София, 1926 p. 17.
37 К. Куев, op. cit., p. 242.
38 Ibid., p. 37.